

**MEETING SYNOPSIS OF THE MARCH 18, 2010
NEW YORK METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COUNCIL**

A. CALL TO ORDER AND INTRODUCTIONS

The meeting was called to order by Mr. Robert Zerrillo of the New York State Department of Transportation (NYSDOT) and Secretary of the New York Metropolitan Transportation Council. The members of the Council introduced themselves. It was declared that there was a quorum. Acting Commissioner Stan Gee of New York State Department of Transportation chaired the meeting.

B. OPENING SESSION

NYMTC's Permanent Council Co-Chair, Acting Commissioner Stan Gee

Acting Commissioner Stan Gee welcomed all attendees to the meeting. He noted that the Council had new members—Nassau County Executive Edward Mangano, Westchester County Executive Robert Astorino, MTA Chairman & Chief Executive Officer Jay Walder, New Jersey Transit's Executive Director James Weinstein, and USEPA's Regional Administrator Judith Enck. He welcomed them all and asked for their agency's continued support. Acting Commissioner Gee welcomed special guest, Adolfo Carrion, the Director of the White House Office of Urban Affairs, and thanked him for joining the meeting to talk about the Federal initiatives that would influence the work in the NYMTC region. He announced the theme for the meeting—"Transportation and a Livable Region," and said there would be lively exchanges of ideas and information from Mr. Carrion and the Council members.

NYMTC's Co-Chair, Amanda Burden, Director, NYC Department of City Planning

Director Amanda Burden of the New York City Department of City Planning welcomed the new Council members to the meeting and said she looked forward to working together with them. Ms. Burden talked about the Council's accomplishments, which included the adoption of a shared vision of the Council's strategic plan for the next 25 years with the primary focus of devoting planning to long-term sustainability through solutions that integrate transportation and land use, providing the amenities that make communities desirable places to live and work, and decreasing carbon emissions. Ms. Burden said that the Shared Vision Plan gave the Council the capacity to be a model for sustainable growth and noted that as the new Federal transportation legislation was being developed, information on the vision needed to be shared. She charge the NYMTC staff to work with other large metropolitan planning organizations around the country to aggregate information of all long-range planning efforts so that the true scope of the transportation needs of large metropolitan region was known as the Federal legislative process moved forward. She said she was privileged to serve as Co-Chair at a critical juncture in the development of transportation policy at the national, regional and local levels.

NYMTC Executive Director's Report

Mr. Joel Ettinger reported the activities the Council had accomplished throughout the year. He said that the Council adopted the Regional Transportation Plan, entitled "A Shared Vision for a Shared Future" and said that the new plan brought together the Council members' shared vision fully into the planning process, as well as fulfilling numerous other regulatory requirements. He said that the socio-economic demographic, traffic congestion and vehicular emissions forecasts that were required were completed. He reported that under demanding deadlines, NYMTC programmed over \$2 billion in the American Recovery and Reinvestment Act of 2009. He said that a Memorandum of Understanding between

NYMTC and four neighboring metropolitan planning organizations in New Jersey and Connecticut was finalized, which would extend the planning process into the larger three state metropolitan region. He said that NYMTC joined with New York University's Rudin Center and put together a Bus Rapid Transit conference to improve transit services. He welcomed the new members of the Council and Adolfo Carrion.

C. KEYNOTE SPEAKER: Adolfo Carrion, Director, White House Office of Urban Affairs

Adolfo Carrion, Director of the White House Office of Urban Affairs, talked about the Administration's focus on building strong regional economies, supporting responsible and sustainable infrastructure and creating opportunity-rich neighborhoods. Mr. Carrion noted that as he traveled around the United States, it was apparent that local entities were driving innovation. He stated that the pace of urbanization—both at home and internationally—created new opportunities and challenges for creating sustainable growth and more affordable living overall. Mr. Carrion praised NYMTC for being in tune with the federal emphasis on livability through the collaborative regional planning process that recognized the need to enhance and expand sustainable development and transportation systems. He said that NYMTC had the kind of collaboration that was in tune with the Administration's desire to ensure that federal investments were led and directed by smart local planning efforts. He credited the New York City Department of Transportation's Commissioner Janette Sadik-Khan and the Director of the New York City Department of City Planning Amanda Burden as champions for the work they have been doing around New York City. He cited the inclusion of funding in the 2010 federal budget for local planning through sustainable communities planning grants and said the work being done at the local level, with the support of the federal government, would help to shape American metropolises by changing patterns of urban development. Mr. Carrion said that the Administration was not just developing affordable housing but moving from affordable housing, which was isolated and disconnected to affordable living, which was connected and integrated into a life of a community and a region. He said the federal government was ready to assist with resources and with planning resources and looked forward to working with NYMTC to restore the region's pride and leadership position as the place of smart-city innovation. Mr. Carrion said it felt great to be back in his hometown, and said that the NYMTC region had a fellow New Yorker, a friend, in the White House.

D. ROUNDTABLE DISCUSSION: Transportation and a Livable Region

NYS Department of Transportation

Acting Commissioner Gee said that livability was having affordable and convenient transportation choices to get to everyday activities and said that pursuing livability had been one of the missions for NYSDOT and its regional partners for quite some time. With the federal government's emphasis on livability, he said that the Council was excited for the opportunity of building on existing community and transportation assets to provide a national model of livability to support the White House's initiative. He said that the NYSDOT formally recognized livability and sustainability in its guiding principals for carrying out the Capital Program and was also undertaking initiatives in Smart Growth, Transit Oriented Development and its Safe Seniors Program. He said that NYSDOT and partner agencies made significant investments in bicycle, pedestrian, connectivity and context sensitive improvement projects, and invested over \$100 million in 2009-2010 through the economic recovery funds. Acting Commissioner Gee said that future opportunities to increase transportation choices in communities that made efficient transportation modes more convenient and accessible that relate directly to the sustainable economic development advantages had to be looked into. He said comprehensive street planning and design, and focusing on transit as a key piece of the comprehensive street planning were examples of these opportunities to look into. He said that the NYSDOT had developed transit oriented development

municipal outreach training programs that focused on leveraging new transit investments by promoting development around existing and new transit centers where design encouraged walking, cycling, street connectivity, traffic calming, mixed used housing development, shops, schools and other public services to reduce the amount of land devoted to parking. Acting Commissioner Gee that the NYSDOT participated in Safe Routes to School national partnership, and through SAFETEA-LU the program funded more than \$27 million in bicycle and pedestrian improvements. He noted that the department also initiated the Safe Senior Pilot Program which aimed at making it easier for seniors to safely get around the communities.

NYC Department of City Planning

Ms. Amanda Burden said the New York region was already one region where growth had been recentralized around transit with the biggest gains in the Bronx, Brooklyn and in Queens. Ms. Burden said that cars must be used less in order to accommodate future growth and provide opportunities for new business, new jobs and to reduce the environmental footprint. She said that the Shared Vision was the overall blueprint for how the region could provide the opportunity for residents to live within walking distance from their jobs, by linking neighborhoods and new growth with local and regional mass transit and by having walkable communities. She said that the Shared Vision served another crucial function and highlighted the needs of transportation partners such as, NYS Department of Transportation, NYC Department of Transportation, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, and the Port Authority of New York and New Jersey for sufficient resources to support environmentally sustainable growth. Ms. Burden said it was necessary to have the support of all levels of government and she looked forward to having a federal partner implementing NYMTC's Shared Vision.

Rockland County

County Executive C. Scott Vanderhoef stressed that livability was not a token expression but a real distinguished kind of approach to how people moved from place to place within the region. County Executive Vanderhoef said that it was important to get cars off the road. He noted that in a time when counties and governments everywhere were struggling financially, to plan for something in the future would be a serious improvement or a "masterstroke", and to create mobility and to create environmental sustainable development throughout the country's I-287 Corridor, Tappan Zee planning efforts goes to the heart of livability. He said that the NYMTC region had come a long way from a decade ago. He said NYMTC was looking at how everything impacted everything else that was done as a neighborhood. County Executive Vanderhoef said that in the mist of budget problems, the eye of the future must be maintained and should not be lost. He commended NYMTC and his fellow Principals for moving the standards that would make the region livable.

Putnam County

Deputy County Executive John Tulley said that Putnam County's designated desired growth area was the Village of Brewster, which was already a transportation hub with the intersections of I-84/I-684 that included a Metro-North train station and two major bus transit routes that provide connection to the train station. Deputy County Executive Tulley said that the county was also in the process of establishing two major off road bikeway projects which would connect pedestrians and bicyclists to the downtown transportation system and the business district. He said that livability was a reflection of a community's quality of life and the transportation improvements focused on Putnam's desired growth areas enhanced the quality of life and thus livability. He said improved mobility, housing and economic development all go hand in hand to achieve livability benefits through transportation projects in Putnam County and in the region. He noted the importance for everyone to work together as a region and thanked NYMTC for their progress.

New York State Department of Environmental Conservation

Commissioner Alexander Grannis talked about how climate change should be considered when addressing sustainability. Commissioner Grannis said that there were risks associated with climate change with existing transportation infrastructure and any discussion on sustainable transportation policy must be looked at through a climate change lens which touches many of the aspects of livability, accessibility and most important reliability. He restated that climate change was a big undertaking and should be a part of any discussion about transportation’s policy sustainability opportunities.

Westchester County

County Executive Robert Astorino echoed his concerns about the Tappan Zee Bridge project and said that the bridge was important for the entire region. County Executive Astorino said the Tappan Zee Bridge linked New York and New Jersey with Connecticut and provided the transportation and services needed to move shipments and cargos. He said it was vitally important to make sure that the Tappan Zee Bridge project was done correctly and done soon, with the awareness that property owners, businesses and the communities that may be affected were protected. He said the county was looking at developing a livable and sustainable way through the county’s centers and historic downtown areas. He talked about how the county was looking into how best to make livable communities for seniors that would be friendly and walkable. He said it was a pleasure to participate in the Annual Meeting for the first time and looked forward to working with his fellow members.

New York City Department of Transportation

Ms. Linda Bailey said that she was representing the New York City Department of Transportation Commissioner Janette Sadik-Khan, who was unable to attend the meeting. Ms. Bailey introduced a prepared video that presented the NYCDOT Green Light for Midtown project. She said that the project had been declared a permanent improvement by Mayor Bloomberg and was working well in terms of traffic flow, safety and appeal. More information of the Green Light for Midtown project can be found on the NYCDOT website at www.nyc.gov/dot

E. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

Murray Bodin of Concerned Grandparents, said there was a disconnect between transportation and a livable region with the heads of transportation agencies and the people who were designated to implement policy. Mr. Bodin talked about the inconsistency of road markings within New York State and said that drivers were entitled to see consistent markings in the roads.

Matt Shotkin said that he lived in New York City for 5 years and was happy with transportation, but the bus system still needed improvements.

George Haikalis, President of Institute for Rational Urban Mobility, Inc., thanked Commissioner Sadik-Khan for presenting the Green Light for Midtown video and was very pleased with the changes made in midtown. He welcomed new federal initiatives that would enhance livability of communities. Mr. Haikalis’ full comments are attached.

F. ACTION ITEMS

1. **ACCEPT: SEPTEMBER 24, 2009 MEETING SYNOPSIS**

Commissioner Stan Gee motioned to accept the September 24, 2009 Council Meeting Synopsis and was seconded by Mr. Chris Boylan, representing the Metropolitan Transportation Authority. The meeting synopsis was accepted. There was no discussion.

2. **ADOPT: RESOLUTION #2010-1 – COUNCIL ADOPTION OF THE 2010-2011 UNIFIED PLANNING WORK PROGRAM**

Acting Commissioner Stan Gee said that the Unified Planning Work Program (UPWP) sets the Council’s priorities and work schedule for the fiscal year. He said that the Program, Finance, and Administration Committee (PFAC) endorsed the UPWP at its February 18, 2010 meeting. He then introduced Mr. Gerry Bogacz to introduce the resolution for adoption.

Mr. Gerry Bogacz, Planning Director of NYMTC, said that the resolution adopted the Unified Planning Work Program (UPWP) for the fiscal year beginning April 1, 2010. Mr. Bogacz said the UPWP was a strategic integrated program of planning projects, and a required product of the federal planning process. He said it also served as a budget for NYMTC and supported the operation of the NYMTC staff, funded approved consultant work, and funded the member agencies’ related planning projects. He noted that there was about \$27.5 million of new federal money that would be involved in the UPWP of which 30% was passed through to NYMTC member agencies. He said that the monies funded planning work from the federal government as well as discretionary work related to the Regional Transportation Plan. The full document and the management summary could be found on the NYMTC website at www.NYMTC.org and was also available at the sign in table.

Acting Commissioner Stan Gee motioned to adopt Resolution #2010-1, Council Adoption of the 2010-2011 Unified Planning Work Program, and was second by Director Amanda Burden of the New York City Department of City Planning. The resolution unanimously passed.

3. **ADOPT: RESOLUTION #2010-2 – RECOGNITION OF DEDICATED SERVICE OF PAST PRINCIPALS OF THE NEW YORK METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COUNCIL: ELLIOT SANDER, FORMER METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER; ANTHONY SHORRIS, FORMER PORT AUTHORITY OF NY&NJ EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR; ANDREW J. SPANO, FORMER WESTCHESTER COUNTY EXECUTIVE; THOMAS R. SUOZZI, FORMER NASSAU COUNTY EXECUTIVE**

Joel Ettinger said that there were four Principals that were no longer with NYMTC and the members wanted to acknowledge their service. He then read the resolution recognizing the past Principals of NYMTC—Elliot Sander, former Chief Executive Officer of the Metropolitan Transportation Authority, Anthony Shorris, former Executive Director of the Port Authority of New York & New Jersey, Andrew J. Spano, former Westchester County Executive, and Thomas R. Suozzi for their service to the Council.

A motion to adopt Resolution #2010-2, Recognition of Dedicated Service of Past Principals of the New York Metropolitan Transportation Council: Elliot Sander, Former Metropolitan Transportation Authority Chief Executive Officer; Anthony Shorris, Former Port Authority of NY&NJ Executive Director; Andrew J. Spano, Former Westchester County Executive; Thomas R. Suozzi, Former Nassau County Executive was motioned by Executive Director Amanda Burden of the New York City Department of

City Planning, and seconded by County Executive C. Scott Vanderhoef of Rockland County. The resolution unanimously passed.

4. ADOPT: RESOLUTION #2010-3 – RECOGNITION OF CO-CHAIR SERVICE BY AMANDA BURDEN, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR, NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF CITY PLANNING

Acting Commissioner Gee and the Council adopted a resolution recognizing Amanda Burden for her service to the Council for the 2009 fiscal year.

A motion to adopt Resolution #2010-3, Recognition of Co-Chair Service by Amanda Burden, Executive Director, New York City Department of City Planning was motioned by Acting Commissioner Stan Gee of the New York State Department of Transportation, and seconded by County Executive C. Scott Vanderhoef of Rockland County. The resolution unanimously passed.

5. CONFIRM: NEW ROTATING CO-CHAIR

Acting Commissioner Gee said as per the Memo of Understanding for the Council, the co-chair is rotated annually among the three Transportation Coordinating Committees (TCCs). Last year, the co-chair was selected from the New York City TCC. This year, the co-chair was selected from the Mid-Hudson South TCC. Acting Commissioner Gee confirmed County Executive C. Scott Vanderhoef of Rockland County as the new co-chair to the New York Metropolitan Transportation Council effective March 19, 2010 through March, 2010.

County Executive Vanderhoef said that he looked forward to the year ahead and thanked Amanda Burden for her leadership on the Council. He made a note that the four past Principals were all actively involved in the NYMTC process and said that NYMTC was functioning better than in the past and he was pleased to take the reigns over as co-chair to the Council.

G. ADJOURN

Acting Commissioner Gee adjourned the meeting.

ATTENDANCE

Voting Council Principals/Representatives

Acting Commissioner Stan Gee, NYS Dept of Transportation
Robert Shinnick for County Executive Steve Levy, Suffolk County
Richard Bianculli for County Executive Edward Mangano, Nassau County
Director Amanda Burden, NYC Department of City Planning
Linda Bailey for Commissioner Janette Sadik-Khan, NYC Department of Transportation
Chris Boylan for Executive Director and C.E.O. Jay Walder, Metropolitan Transportation Authority
County Executive Astorino, Westchester County
Deputy County Executive John Tully for County Executive Robert Bondi, Putnam County
County Executive C. Scott Vanderhoef, Rockland County
Robert Zerrillo, NYMTC Secretary

Advisory (Non-Voting) Principals/Representatives

Division Administrator Jeffrey Kolb, Federal Highway Administration
Reg. Administrator Brigid Hynes-Cherin, Federal Transit Administration Executive Director
Executive Director Mary K. Murphy, North Jersey Transportation Planning Authority, Inc.
Regional Administrator Judith Enck, US Environmental Protection Agency
Richard Roberts representing Regional Administrator George Warrington, New Jersey Transit
Chris O. Ward, Port Authority of New York and New Jersey
Commissioner Alexander B. Grannis, NYS Department of Environmental Conservation

NYMTC Staff

Wieslawa Amber	Maria Garcia	Kathy Monroe
Voncille Anderson	Anthony Gawrych	Nancy O'Connell
Gerry Bogacz	Jean Gunsch	Munnesh Patel
Kuo-Ann Chiao	Stephen Hausch	Shalendra Ramadhin
Lisa Daglian	Mikhail Kotikovskoy	Mohammad Rashid
Nina DelSenno	Ralph Lawrence	Chris Rodrigues-Moore
David Drits	John Lopez	Jean Shanahan
Daniel Etkin	Howard J. Mann	
Joel Ettinger	Ella Matthews	
Leslie Fordjour	Larry McAuliffe	
Emma Gaitan	Andrea Miles-Cole	

OTHERS

David Aimen, The Louis Berger Group	Noah Budnick, Transportation Alternatives
Onyinye Akujuo, NYCDOT	Sonia Burgos, US HUD
Renee Alberts, Urban Prairie	Adolfo Carrion, US White House
Darin Allan, FTA	Patricia Chemka, Westchester County DOT
Vincent Altieri, Rockland County	Howard Chynsky, HAKS
Manuel Alverado, NYSDEC	Bobby Cuza, NY News
Tom Ambroselo, NYS Assembly	Ignacio Contreras, Hunter College
Mary Ameen, NJTPA	Alain Conze
Robert Ancar, NYSDOT	Stephen Corson, Man. Boro Pres, Stringer Off
Gilbert Anderson, Suffolk County	Gail Davis, PANYNJ
Richard Anderson, NY Bldg. Congress	Jim Davis, NYSDOT
Lance Anderson, LIRR	Jack Dean, MTA
Dave Armstrong, MTA	Allison DeCerreño, PANYNJ
Linda Bailey, NYCDOT	Debra Devine, NYS Housing
Hersh Barry, NYC	Penny Eickermeyer, UTRC
Richard Barbieri, Village of Lynbrook	Ashley Emerson, Columbia University
Corey Bearak, Esq., Gov't & Public Affairs	Phil Eng, NYSDOT
Lawrence Berger, Nassau County	Tom Elison, Environmental Defense Fund
Ligeia Benson, NYCDOT	Phil Eng, NYSDOT
Murray Bodin, Concerned Grandparents	Peter Feroe, MTA Bus Co
Jay Bond, AIA Chamber	Christina T. Ticicchia, NYCLAVACC

Bronson Fox, Moynihan Station Develop Corp
Patrick Foye, Nassau County
Patrick Gerdin, Rockland County
Joseph Giannetto, Lorden Assoc. Ltd.
Adam Glantz, HUD NY Reg. Office
Leon Goodman, Stevens Institute of Tech
Sam Goodman, Bx Boro President
Victoria Grimshaw, NYC DOH
George Haikalis, IRUM
Gary Hallock, NYSDHCR
Kag Hart, Hunter College
Samuel Hornick, NYCDCP
Jessica Johnson, Johnson Security
Raymond Kenard
Jee Mee Kim, Sam Schwartz Engrg
Peter King, NYSDOT
Anne Krzyzanowski, Assembly Nolan's Off
Rachel Levin, Hunter College
Adam Levin, NYSDOT
Michael Levin
Francis Lipinski
Diane Lombardi, NYSDOT
Roger Maldonado, PFNYC
Ronald Marsico, PANYNJ
John Mattered, NYC Parks
Susan McSherry, NYCDOT
Angela Miraglia, NYSDOT
Michael Moltzen, USEPA
Rosana Morganti, Hunter College
Rona Moyer, Nassau County
Michael Newey, ARUP
David Nimowitz, Urban Prairie
Alicia Nolan, FHWA
Bob Olmsted
Charlie O'Shea, NYSDOT
Kimberly Patterson, Cambridge Systematics
Elizabeth Perdomo, LaGuardia Community College
Renee Peters-Smith, NYCDOT
Danielle Petretta, URTC

John Pilner, Putnam County
Asheque Rahman, NYCDOT
Laxmi Ramasubramanian, Hunter College
Ophelia Ray-Fenner, NYCDOT
Sarah Rios, MTA
Richard Roberts, NJT
Lillian Robertson, NYSDOT
Mary Rocco, Hunter College
Richard Roper, PANYNJ
Jeffrey Rowe, Louis Berger
Steven Russo, MTA
Lawrence Salley, Westchester County
Sean Sallie, Nassau County
Diana Salter
Patrick Sbano, MTA B&T
Adam Schildge
Jack Schmidt, NYCDCP
Jared Schneider
Kevin Scott, NYSDOT
Julia Seltzer, MTA
Robert Shinnick, Suffolk County
Matt Shotkin
Gail Spears
Heather Sporn, NYSDOT
James Stover, MTA
Adaryll Taylor, NYCDOT
Brian Ten Siethoff, Cambridge Systematics
Jai Therattil, NYCDOT
Carlos Vallejo, NJT
Veronica Vanterpool
Lou Venech, PANYNJ
Roxanne Warren, Vision 42
Ira Weiner, HUD NY Regional Office
David Widawsky, PANYNJ
Sandy Wolff, Hunter College
Jing Xuan, Univ. of California
Melanie Zeman, USEPA

This March 18, 2010 Council Meeting synopsis was unanimously accepted by all members of the Council at its Annual Meeting held on March 10, 2011.

Respectfully Submitted,

*Andrea' Miles-Cole
Secretary 2 - NYMTIC*